
Chapter 1: Overview

1 Introduction

This Report covers matters arising out of the Compliance Audit of some State Government Departments and their Autonomous Bodies. The primary purpose of this Report is to bring to the notice of the Legislature the important results of audit. The findings of audit are expected to enable the Executive to take corrective action as also to frame policies and directives that will lead to improved financial management of the organisations contributing to better governance.

The Report has been organised in three chapters as under:

- **Chapter 1** contains the profile of the Auditee Departments with a brief profile of the receipt/ expenditure for the last five years, the authority for audit, audit jurisdiction, planning and conduct of audit, response of the Government to various audit products, namely Inspection Reports, Draft Paragraphs/ Detailed Compliance Audit Paragraphs, follow up action on Audit Reports, *etc.*, and Significant Audit observations included in this Audit Report.
- **Chapter 2** of this Report contains observations relating to five Detailed Compliance Audit paragraphs on (i) Delivery of Health Care Services in selected District Hospitals, (ii) Working of West Bengal Building & Other Construction Workers' Welfare Board, (iii) Functioning of *Krishak Bazars* in West Bengal, (iv) Adequacy (sufficiency, assessment of quality) of Working Women's Hostels and (v) Construction and Functioning of Hostels under School Education, Backward Classes Welfare and Tribal Development Departments.
- **Chapter 3** of this Report contains individual Draft Paragraphs relating to Compliance Audits.

1.2 Profile of the Auditee Departments and Audit Universe

D) As per the Budget Publication, the Government of West Bengal releases 77 grants, of which 56 are active¹, related to its various departments. The audit universe under the office of the Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), West Bengal (PAG), comprises 3,333 units of various levels related to 34 Grants. There are 32 Departments under audit jurisdiction of PAG (Audit-I), West Bengal. It also includes 120 bodies/ authorities which are either substantially financed from the Consolidated Fund of the State or audit of which has been entrusted by the Government under various sections of the Comptroller & Auditor General's (CAG's) DPC (Duties, Powers and Conditions of Service) Act, 1971. List of Departments and Autonomous Bodies/ Authorities/ Corporations under the audit jurisdiction of the office of the Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), West Bengal is shown in *Appendix 1.1*.

¹ Against the remaining 21 grants there was no budgetary allocation

Trend of expenditure in major Departments under the audit jurisdiction of the office of the Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), West Bengal during 2015-20 is shown in **Table 1.1**.

Table 1.1: Trend of expenditure of Departments with annual expenditure exceeding ₹ 100 crore
(₹ in crore)

Name of the Department	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20
Agriculture	2,113.20	1,649.40	1,705.16	6,080.13	3046.24
Agricultural Marketing	159.37	107.00	117.20	198.36	131.70
Animal Resources Development	601.68	666.63	672.14	730.25	654.31
Backward Classes Welfare	1,484.31	1,068.11	1,664.12	1,755.41	557.64
Cooperation	399.52	492.49	352.38	333.25	433.06
Correctional Administration	197.95	232.73	270.66	327.81	339.19
Finance	57,860.49	53,899.43	68,868.68	92,973.76	91,309.92
Fisheries	284.15	287.17	311.41	155.71	243.95
Food & Supplies	3,958.69	8,156.28	9,316.91	10,971.79	7,193.13
Health and Family Welfare	7,727.98	8,124.24	8,772.55	9,560.69	10,734.22
Higher Education	2,661.69	2,996.61	3,024.43	3,638.28	3,570.42
Home and Hill Affairs	6,160.27	6,639.84	6,789.94	7,994.64	9,167.02
Irrigation & Waterways	1,503.76	1,720.01	1,716.09	1,966.88	1,856.68
Judicial	533.17	620.01	630.85	818.57	807.76
Labour	652.11	753.50	841.86	820.43	821.67
Mass Education Extension & Library Services	241.25	277.99	249.75	279.85	235.19
Minority Affairs & Madrasah Education	1,814.35	1,579.78	2,035.40	2,896.44	2,647.05
North Bengal Development	450.91	423.02	503.72	680.37	461.60
Panchayats & Rural Development	16,975.89	14,988.96	21,001.77	19,055.96	18,828.66
Planning, Statistics and Programme Monitoring	385.38	370.78	395.88	281.53	251.30
School Education	16,833.02	18,599.25	20,103.68	23,017.59	26,720.35
Self Help Groups & Self Employment	455.17	450.15	612.22	505.86	683.56
Sunderban Affairs	286.12	300.91	326.76	511.20	406.95
Technical Education, Training & Skill Development	622.37	699.19	480.54	782.75	675.49
Tribal Development	494.26	588.67	562.96	706.73	572.83
Water Resources Investigation & Development	1,035.52	962.49	922.87	1,054.93	1,008.27
Women and Child Development and Social Welfare	3,644.86	3,966.39	4,293.77	6,021.09	9,654.02
Others ²	852.71	1,153.19	960.04	1,255.24	519.55
Total	1,30,390.15	1,31,774.22	1,57,503.74	1,95,375.50	1,93,531.73

Source: Sub-Head Accounts and Appropriation Accounts 2015-16 to 2019-20.

II) Under receipt audit (tax revenue), there are 500 auditable units under Finance Department. Details of the actual receipts in respect of the tax revenue raised during the period 2015-16 to 2019-20 are given in **Table 1.2** below:

Table 1.2: Details of the actual receipts in respect of the tax revenue raised during the period 2015-16 to 2019-20
(₹ in crore)

Sl. No.	Heads of Revenue	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20
1.	State Goods & Service Tax	0.00	0.00	14,963.74	27,067.00	27,308.00
2	Taxes on Agricultural Income	7.85	6.57	7.14	0.92	0.65

² Others include Chief Minister's Office, Consumer Affairs Department, Council of Ministers, Food Processing Industries & Horticulture Department, Law Department, Paschimanchal Unnayan Affairs Department and Youth Services & Sports Department.

Sl. No.	Heads of Revenue	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20
3	Taxes on Professions, Trade, Calling & Employment	485.50	509.09	529.20	560.78	588.72
4	Stamp & Registration Fees	4,174.97	4,382.73	5,260.77	5,620.01	6,025.79
5	State Excise	4,015.12	5,226.16	9,340.05	10,622.45	11,232.29
6	Central Sales Tax	1,899.37	2,436.13	1,036.94	705.48	387.10
7	State Sales Tax	6,877.46	7,231.33	5,754.12	6,971.38	6,890.42
8	West Bengal Value Added Tax	17,273.27	18,315.16	6,209.55	136.15	-116.35
9	Taxes & Duties on Electricity	2,091.63	1,318.87	2,333.55	610.06	369.42
	Total	36,825.17	39,426.04	45,435.06	52,294.23	52,686.04

Source: Finance Accounts of the respective year

Regarding non-tax revenue, details of the actual receipts raised during the period 2015-16 to 2019-20 are given in **Table 1.3** below:

Table 1.3: Details of the actual receipts in respect of non-tax revenue raised during the period 2015-16 to 2019-20 (₹ in crore)

Sl. No.	Department	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20
1.	Agriculture	43.93	42.80	47.19	45.30	41.86
2	Animal Resources Development	4.05	4.03	8.81	2.99	2.76
3	Cooperation	8.49	8.46	10.05	8.53	7.68
4	Fisheries	1.81	1.60	8.02	5.40	1.14
5	Food & Supplies	11.55	28.57	17.33	43.55	43.73
6	Health and Family Welfare	112.45	134.79	210.48	261.80	243.91
7	Higher Education	37.37	37.41	41.92	38.77	39.12
8	Home and Hill Affairs	104.93	150.75	187.19	254.55	181.94
9	Irrigation & Waterways	25.64	24.92	26.19	34.44	30.80
10	Labour	13.58	8.56	6.03	23.52	8.23
11	Panchayats & Rural Development	1.76	1.56	4.33	0.15	0.03
12	School Education#	2.28	122.75	7.73	4.78	2.87
13	Youth Services & Sports	10.93	9.76	11.00	12.18	12.50
14	Technical Education, Training & Skill Development	4.10	3.98	4.53	4.56	4.04
15	Women and Child Development and Social Welfare	44.69	2.73	3.73	1.41	0.10
Total		427.56	582.67	594.53	741.93	620.71

Source: Finance Accounts of the respective year. # School Education includes 0202-01-General Education-101-Elementary Education and 102-Secondary Education

Note 1: Non-tax receipts which are depicted Department-wise in Finance Accounts, have been considered in Table 1.3. Consequently non-tax receipts of Agricultural Marketing, Backward Classes Welfare, Consumer Affairs, Correctional Administration, Finance, Food Processing Industries & Horticulture, Judicial, Law, Mass Education Extension & Library Services, Minority Affairs & Madrasah Education, North Bengal Development, Paschimanchal Unnayan Affairs, Planning, Statistics and Programme Monitoring, Self-Help Groups & Self Employment, Sunderban Affairs, Tribal Development and Water Resources Investigation & Development Departments could not be depicted here.

Note 2: Non-tax receipts like interest receipts, dividends, stationery & printing, other administrative services, contribution & recoveries towards pension and others retirement benefits, miscellaneous general services and petroleum, could not be segregated Department-wise from Finance Accounts, so these have not been considered in Table 1.3.

1.3 Authority for audit

Authority for audit by the CAG is derived from Articles 149 and 151 of the Constitution of India and the CAG's (Duties, Powers & Conditions of Service) Act, 1971 (DPC Act). CAG conducts audit of expenditure of State Government

Departments under Section³ 13 of the CAG's DPC Act. CAG is the sole auditor in respect of Autonomous Bodies, which are audited under sections 19 (2), 19 (3)⁴ and 20 (1)⁵ of the DPC Act. In addition, CAG also conducts audit of other Autonomous Bodies which are substantially financed by the Government under Section⁶ 14 of DPC Act. Section 16 of the CAG's DPC Act authorises CAG to audit all receipts (both revenue and capital) of the Government of India and of Government of each state and of each Union territory having a legislative assembly and to satisfy himself that the rules and procedures are designed to secure an effective check on the assessment, collection and proper allocation of revenue and are being duly observed. Principles and methodologies for various audits are prescribed in the Regulations on Audit & Accounts, 2007 and Auditing Standards issued by the Indian Audit & Accounts Department.

1.4 Planning and conduct of Audit

Compliance Audits are conducted as per the Annual Audit Plan (AAP). Units for Compliance Audit are selected on the basis of risk assessment of the Apex units, Audit Units and Implementing Agencies involving matters of financial significance, social relevance, internal control systems, past instances of defalcation, misappropriation, embezzlement, *etc.*, as well as findings of previous Audit Reports.

Inspection Reports are issued to the heads of Units after completion of audit. Based on replies received, audit observations are either settled or further action for compliance is advised. Important audit findings are processed further as Draft Paragraphs for inclusion in the Audit Report. Detailed Compliance Audit paragraphs are prepared on issues of significance, selection of issues are done following the analogy explained above.

Formal replies furnished by Departments are carefully considered while finalising the materials for inclusion in the Audit Report. Audit Reports are laid before the State Legislature under Article 151 of the Constitution of India.

1.5 Lack of response of Government to Audit

Response of the Government to Inspection Reports

Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), West Bengal, conducts audit of Government Departments to check for compliance to rules and regulations in transactions and to verify the regularity in maintenance of important accounting and other records as per the prescribed rules and procedures. After these audits, Inspection Reports (IRs) are issued to the Heads of Offices inspected with copies to the next higher authorities. Important irregularities and other points

³ Audit of (i) all expenditure from the Consolidated Fund of State, (ii) all transactions relating to Contingency Funds and Public Accounts and (iii) all trading, manufacturing, profit & loss accounts, balance-sheets & other subsidiary accounts.

⁴ Audit of the accounts of Corporations (not being Companies) established by or under law made by the State Legislature in accordance with the provisions of the respective legislations or as per request of the Governor of the State in the public interest.

⁵ Audit of accounts of any body or authority on the request of the Governor, on such terms and conditions as may be agreed upon between the CAG and the Government.

⁶ Several non-Commercial Autonomous/ Semi-Autonomous Bodies, established to implement Schemes for employment generation, poverty alleviation, spread of literacy, health for all and prevention of diseases, environment, *etc.*, and substantially financed by the Government, are audited under Section 14.

detected during inspection, which are not settled on the spot, find place in IRs. Serious irregularities are brought to the notice of the Government by the Office of the PAG.

As per the Regulations on Audit & Accounts, 2007, the Officer in charge of the auditee entity shall send the reply to an Inspection Report (IR) within four weeks of its receipt. On intimation of any serious irregularity by Audit, the Government shall undertake *prima facie* verification of facts and send a preliminary report to Audit confirming or denying facts within six weeks of receipt of intimation. Where the fact of major irregularity is not denied by the Government in the preliminary report, the Government shall further send a detailed report to Audit within three months of preliminary report indicating the remedial action taken to prevent recurrence and action taken against those responsible for the lapse.

Besides the above, Finance Department of Government of West Bengal had also issued instructions (June 1982) for prompt response by the executive to IRs issued by the PAG to ensure timely corrective action in compliance with the prescribed rules and procedures and to ensure accountability for the deficiencies, lapses, *etc.* observed during inspections.

A six monthly report showing the pendency of IRs is sent to the Principal Secretary/ Secretary of the respective department to facilitate monitoring and settlement of outstanding audit observations in the pending IRs.

Inspection Reports issued up to March 2020 relating to 276 offices under four departments⁷ showed that 1,242 paragraphs relating to 425 IRs remained outstanding to the end of March 2021. Department-wise and year-wise break-up of the outstanding IRs and Paragraphs are detailed in *Appendix 1.2*.

The unsettled IRs contained 150 paragraphs involving serious irregularities like theft, defalcation, misappropriation, *etc.*, of Government money, loss of revenue and shortages, losses not recovered/ written off amounting ₹ 182.26 crore. The Department-wise and nature-wise analysis of the outstanding paragraphs of serious nature showed the following position:

Table 1.4: Analysis of outstanding paragraphs on serious irregularities
(₹ in lakh)

Name of the Department	Cases of theft/ defalcation/ misappropriation		Loss of revenue		Shortage/ losses neither recovered nor written off		Total	
	Paragraphs	Amount	Paragraphs	Amount	Paragraphs	Amount	Paragraphs	Amount
Agricultural Marketing	00	0.00	08	1,396.82	00	0.00	08	1,396.82
Higher Education	08	181.40	30	319.75	01	0.00	39	501.15
Irrigation & Waterways	02	12.54	52	1,746.00	01	103.07	55	1,861.61
Labour	02	1.09	42	14,465.37	04	0.34	48	14,466.80
Total	12	195.03	132	17,927.94	06	103.41	150	18,226.38

Source: Inspection Reports

Audit Committees, comprising of the Principal Secretary/ Secretary of the administrative departments and representatives of the Finance Department and

⁷ Agriculture Department; Higher Education Department; Irrigation & Waterways Department and Labour Department.

Audit, were formed in 17 out of 32 Departments under purview of Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), West Bengal office for expeditious settlement of outstanding Inspection Reports/ Paragraphs. Audit Committees were not formed by the remaining 15 Departments⁸ under this Office. Of the 17 Departments where Audit Committees were formed, only one meeting was held by one⁹ Department during April 2019 to March 2020, wherein 10 paragraphs were discussed without settlement of any IR. Though the remaining 16 Departments had Audit Committees, they did not hold any meeting during this period.

It is recommended that Government should ensure that a procedure is put in place for (i) action against officials failing to send replies to IRs/ paragraphs as per the prescribed time schedule, (ii) recovery of losses/ outstanding advances/ overpayments, *etc.* in a time-bound manner and (iii) holding at least one meeting of each Audit Committee every quarter.

1.6 Response of Departments to Draft Audit Paragraphs and Detailed Compliance Audit Paragraphs

Regulations on Audit & Accounts, 2007 stipulate that responses to Draft Audit Paragraphs proposed for inclusion in the Report of the Comptroller & Auditor General of India should be sent within six weeks¹⁰.

Draft Paragraphs and Detailed Compliance Audit Paragraphs are forwarded to the Principal Secretaries/ Secretaries of the concerned Departments as well as to the Finance Department, drawing attention to the audit findings and requesting them to send response within prescribed time frame. It is also brought to their personal attention that in view of the likely inclusion of such paragraphs in the Audit Reports of the Comptroller & Auditor General of India which are placed before the Legislature, it would be desirable to include their comments on these audit findings.

Draft Paragraphs and Detailed Compliance Audit Paragraphs proposed for inclusion in this Report were forwarded to the Principal Secretaries/ Secretaries of the concerned Departments and to the Finance Department between June 2021 and September 2021 through Official/ Demi-official letters addressed to them by name. The concerned Department/ Directorate had sent reply to five (in respect of one Detailed Compliance Audit, one out of two Departments involved, had submitted the reply) out of the 30 Draft Paragraphs/ Detailed Compliance Audit Paragraphs featured in Audit Report. This apart, Swasthya Sathi Samiti (Samiti) and West Bengal State Rural Development Agency (WBSRDA) have submitted replies pertaining to three individual draft paragraphs.

Responses of Departments/ Directorates/ Samiti/ WBSRDA as well as the replies to initial audit memos, wherever received, have been suitably incorporated in the Report.

⁸ *Mass Education & Extension & Library Services, Self Help Group & Self Employment, Tribal Development, North Bengal Development, Paschimanchal Unnayan Affairs and Sunderban Affairs, Agriculture, Agricultural Marketing, Animal Resources Development, Food Processing Industries and Horticulture, Fisheries, Consumer Affairs, Cooperation, Irrigation & Waterways and Water Resources Investigation & Development Departments*

⁹ *Health & Family Welfare Department*

¹⁰ *State Government's Finance (Budget) Department, in its order dated June 1982, however, directed all the Departments to submit their responses to proposed Draft Paragraphs within one month.*

1.7 Follow-up on Audit Reports

Audit Report (AR) for the year 2015-16, which was submitted to the Governor in February 2017, was laid on the floor of the State Legislature in March 2018, while the AR for the year 2016-17 was laid in July 2019. ARs for the years 2017-18 and 2018-19 are yet to be laid on the floor of the State Legislative Assembly (September 2021). A mechanism to ensure promptness in tabling of Audit Reports should be put in place.

After tabling of the Reports of the CAG of India in the State Legislature, the State Government Departments are required to submit *suo motu* replies to the audit observations within one month. Review of outstanding replies on paragraphs included in the CAG's Audit Reports on the Government of West Bengal, between 2008-09 and 2016-17, showed that replies relating to 384 paragraphs involving 32 Departments (excluding omnibus paragraphs involving a number of Departments) remained outstanding as of March 2021 (*Appendix 1.3*). Out of 384 paragraphs, 34 paragraphs pertaining to 2008-09 to 2016-17 were selected for discussion by the Public Accounts Committee (PAC)/ Committee on Public Undertakings (COPU).

As stipulated in the Rules of Procedure of the PAC and the Committee on Public Undertakings (COPU), Administrative Departments were required to take suitable action on recommendations made in the Reports of PAC/ COPU presented to the State Legislature and submit comments on the action taken or proposed to be taken on those recommendations within three months.

Action Taken Notes on 51 paragraphs contained in 30 Reports of the PAC/ COPU, presented to the Legislature between 1991-92 and 2018-19, had not been submitted by 12 Departments to the Legislative Assembly as of March 2021. These Reports of the PAC/ COPU had suggested recovery, disciplinary action, *etc.* A significant case is elaborated in *Appendix 1.4*.

Action taken by administrative Departments on the recommendations of the PAC/ COPU were, however, found to be inadequate and wanting.

1.8 Significant Audit Observations in this Report

The present Report contains five Detailed Compliance Audit Paragraphs and twenty five Draft Paragraphs arising out of Compliance Audit.

The significant observations contained in this Report are discussed in brief in the following paragraphs.

Detailed Compliance Audit Paragraphs

Delivery of Health Care Services in selected District Hospitals

District Hospital is secondary level referral hospital responsible for catering the health-care needs of a district. Its objective is to provide comprehensive secondary health care services to the people in the district at an acceptable level of quality and being responsive and sensitive to the needs of people and referring centres. Every district is expected to have a district hospital, with varying bed strength depending on the size, terrain and population of the district. District Hospital should be in a position to provide all basic specialty services and should aim to develop super-specialty services gradually. At present, there

are 17 district hospitals (excluding MCHs and newly upgraded district hospitals) for 23 districts of the State, which are providing preventive, promotive and curative healthcare services to the population, as secondary health care hospitals.

At the State level, the Directorate of Health Services (DHS), which functions under the Health & Family Welfare (H&FW) Department, is overall responsible for functioning of various level of health care facilities including the District Hospitals. At the district level, the Medical Superintendent of the District Hospital, under the Chief Medical Officer of Health (CMOH), of the district is responsible for functioning of District hospitals. Under the National Health Mission, which is implemented in Society mode, the Executive Committee of the State Health Society (SHS) is headed by the Principal Secretary, Health and Family Welfare Department who is assisted by Mission Director, NRHM. At the district level, the Executive Committee of District Health Society (DHS) is headed by Chief Medical Officer Health (CMOH).

A Detailed Compliance Audit was undertaken on Delivery of Health Care Services in selected District Hospitals. The main objective of this Detailed Compliance Audit was to examine whether provisions for line services (such as Out Patient Department, In Patient Department, Intensive care unit, Operation Theater, maternity services, *etc.*) as well as support & auxiliary services (*viz.*, diagnostic, diet, bio-medical waste management, *etc.*) conformed to standards introduced by Indian Public Health Standards (IPHS). Audit also attempted to assess whether availability of resources of the District Hospitals (*viz.*, drug, equipment, manpower *etc.*) was in consonance with the relevant norms and standards.

The audit scope of this DCA covered public health facilities of three selected District Hospitals (namely Balurghat District Hospital, Suri District Hospital and Jhargram District Hospital) primarily covering a five years' period starting from 2014-15, with observations on crucial aspects updated for 2019-20 and 2020-21. Selection of district hospitals was done using sampling techniques from stratified lists prepared after giving weightage to bed-strength, load of IPD & OPD patients and expenditure incurred. Apart from these three DHs, audit examination also encompassed records maintained at the H&FW Department and DHS. State Project Management Unit (SPMU) of NHM and Chief Medical Officers Health (CMOsH) of three Districts (namely Dakshin Dinajpur, Birbhum and Jhargram), were also covered in review.

Planning and budgeting:

- H&FW Department neither prescribed its own norms nor expressly followed the norms/ standards suggested in IPHS by the Government of India in respect of resources and services for district hospitals. The relevant norms of IPHS was not expressly adopted either. Absence of attainable norms compounded by non-preparation of any District Health Action Plans resulted in non-identification of gap in respect of facilities/ infrastructure. Therefore, locally felt needs were not duly reflected in the Programme Implementation Plan under NHM with a concomitant adverse impact on the availability of resources and service provisioning.

Line Services:

- Functioning of Out Patient Department (OPD) was affected by inadequate number of doctors; on a number of occasion OPDs were not held on scheduled dates. Some OPDs were not even functional for want of doctors. Patient satisfaction surveys on OPD services were not conducted properly; neither were adequate efforts made to identify and address the deficiencies for improvement.
- In the three test-checked District Hospitals, five out of 13 essential Indoor Patient Services in IPD wards were not available while almost none of the 18 super specialty services, excepting two, was in existence. As regards essential and crucial IPD services, Suri DH had its CCU non-functional from October 2019 to February 2020. Acute shortage of trained manpower, drugs, equipment, *etc.*, were noticed in CCU, Emergency and Operation Theatre services provided by the selected DHs. Surgical safety was compromised by not complying to pre and post-surgical checklist.
- In post natal care, a large number of mothers were discharged within 48 hours of delivery ignoring inherent risk of developing complications. Many labour room drugs were not in stock. A number of instances were noticed where deaths of mothers were not reviewed. Available Maternal Death Review (MDR) showed gaps at DH levels labour room facilities leading to fatalities of mothers. As gaps were never plugged, MDR served no meaningful purpose. Child Death Reviews showed a number of deaths were preventable. Lack of minimal respiratory support in Jhargram DH continued to be a matter of concern as it factored in child death.

Availability of resources:

- In absence of Drug and Therapeutic Committees, there existed no drug formulary and drug procurement plan. As a result, there were instances like large number of essential drugs not being procured or remaining out of stock. This would have led to significant out-of-pocket expenditure being burdened on the patients, especially the poor. Moreover, alarming instances were noticed where non-standard and expired drugs were administered to patients representing serious laxity in control mechanism. Storage condition of drugs also called for special attention.
- Inventory of equipment was not properly maintained in the test-checked DHs. There were acute shortage of Eye, ENT and Endoscopy equipment compared to normative requirement envisaged by IPHS. Moreover, anomaly in stock and physical existence of equipment were observed by Audit.
- There was no definite sanctioned strength devised for the DHs, though conflicting data were available with the Department and the test-checked District Hospitals. However, there were acute shortage in the cadres of Medical Officer and Nursing Staff. Evidently, the H&FW Department was not in a position to frame any time bound plan for filling up the vacancies. The test-checked DHs having 850 beds in average, exhibited acute shortage of man power even against normative strength of manpower envisaged in IPHS for a 500-bedded DH. Prospect of delivery of specialty/ super specialty services at district level remains remote as 15 *per cent* of sanctioned Human Resources for Specialty/ Super Specialty services was posted in Balurghat DH.

- There was sub-optimal and inefficient utilisation of infrastructure. Even after commencement of delivery of service, the DH authorities could not utilise the huge infrastructure created for the SSHs, non-posting of human resources being the main attributable factor. Though there had been substantial increase in sanctioned bed strength (by 92 to 116 *per cent*), the same could not be translated into equivalent increase in functional beds in two test-checked District Hospitals. A large portion of newly created civil infrastructure and procured furniture/ fixtures for super specialty hospitals have been lying idle. This apart, as super specialty services could not be operationalised, a number of costly and sophisticated equipment supplied for Super Specialty Hospitals lied packed for years. Pipeline Supply of Medical Gases could not be operationalized creating hindrance in delivery of proper health care services to patients' Liquid waste was irregularly discharged in Balurghat DH in absence of proper drainage system.

Support and auxiliary services:

- Wide range of IPHS-stipulated essential diagnostic services were not available in the DHs. A number of essential X-Ray machines to ensure delivery of desired radiology services in a district hospital were not in service. The available machines were also sub-optimally utilized leading to inordinately high Turnaround Time (TAT). Some essential radiological tests were not available in the DHs. Up to 78 *per cent* of essential laboratory equipment were either not available or acutely short of required number. Instances were observed where laboratory test results, when cross-verified externally, were proved erroneous.
- Not only the cleanliness and hygiene of the kitchen site was ill maintained, sub-standard quality of food was served, and that too in insufficient quantity, by the private contractors outsourced by DHs. There was no monitoring on part of the DHs, which allowed the private contractors to continue with such unacceptable service violating norms of diet services. Other fossil fuels were used for cooking instead of LPG.
- No inventory of linens was maintained in Balurghat DH, whereabouts of linens were not known in Balurghat and Jhargram DHs. Significant quantity of hospital linens was missing in Suri DH. Audit observed systemic lacunae in regular change and washing of bed linens. None of the DHs followed the process of disinfection and sluicing of linens before handing over linens to the outsourced contractors for laundry service. The private contractors were allowed to use hospital infrastructure and resources like water, electricity, *etc.*, in Balurghat and Jhargram DH without any provision of the same in, agreement.
- Balurghat DH and Suri DH were operating with inadequate/ partial authorisation of West Bengal Pollution Control Board. Category wise accounting of Bio-Medical Waste (BMW) generation at source was not done in Balurghat DH. Untreated BMW, in contravention to rules, remained stored in Balurghat and Jhargram DH for more than 48 hours. Instances of irregular segregation and mixing of BMW with municipal solid waste were noticed in Balurghat and Jhargram DH. Liquid BMW were found to be discharged without treatment leaving substantial scope of spread of contamination. Discharge was not even through a proper drainage system in Balurghat DH

which involved risk of outbreak of infection. Monitoring of management, as found in Balurghat DH, was grossly deficient.

Monitoring and regulatory system:

- Norms of National Quality Assurance Scheme guidelines were not adhered to by Balurghat DH leading to failure of the DH in independent quality assessment of services. Suri DH also had conducted only two internal assessments. Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) were not discussed and analysed to assess performance in Balurghat and Jhargram DH. Internal and Medical audits were never carried out, neither was death audit, other than maternal and neo-natal deaths.

(Paragraph 2.1)

Working of West Bengal Building & Other Construction Workers' Welfare Board

Government of India (GoI) enacted (August 1996) the Building and Other Construction Workers (Regulation of Employment and Conditions of Service) Act, 1996 (Act) to regulate the employment and conditions of service of building and other construction workers and to provide for their safety, health and welfare measures. Under the Act, State Governments were to constitute the Building and Other Construction Workers' Welfare Boards. To augment resources of the Building and Other Construction Workers' Welfare Boards through levy and collection of cess on the cost of construction incurred by employers, GoI also enacted (August 1996) Building and Other Construction Workers Welfare Cess Act, 1996 (Cess Act). Ministry of Labour, GoI notified (September 1996) the levy of cess at the rate of one *per cent* of the total cost of construction. For implementing provisions of the Cess Act, the Building and Other Construction Workers Welfare Cess Rules, 1998 (Cess Rules), was enacted (March 1998) by the GoI.

For implementation of the Act in the State Government of West Bengal (GoWB) framed (October 2004) the West Bengal Building and Other Construction Workers (Regulation of Employment and Conditions of Service) Rules, 2004 (Rules) and constituted (September 2005) the West Bengal Building and Other Construction Workers' Welfare Board (Board). The Board was to function under the Labour Department. In keeping with the provision of the Act and Rules, the Board constituted (January 2006) a fund namely the West Bengal Building and Other Construction Workers' Welfare Fund (BOCWFF) for grant of benefits to building and other construction workers and also for meeting its establishment/ operational expenses. Cess, as referred to above, was the major source of the BOCWFF.

A Detailed Compliance Audit on the working of the Board was undertaken, which was aimed to assess whether planning for implementation of schemes, assessment and collection of cess, facilities and privileges provided to the labourers, monitoring, *etc.*, were in compliance with the relevant acts and rules. This DCA was conducted between January and August 2021, records maintained in the offices of the Board, Kolkata and seven out of 68 Regional Labour Offices (RLO) in the State for the period from 2015-16 to 2019-20 were test-checked. Further, records of two municipal corporations, 11 Municipalities, two Zilla Parishads (ZPs) and two Development Authorities under the

jurisdiction of those seven selected RLOs were test-checked. The audit team also audited records of the office of the Directorate of Factories, WB.

Planning:

- State Advisory Committee (SAC) and the Board were essentially meant to strengthen the implementation mechanism. However, non-reconstitution of the SAC and the delayed reconstitution of the Board, shortfalls in holding meetings of the SAC/ Board, and even non-implementation of recommendations (both from operational and functional points of view) of the Board, threw poor light on the implementation of the Act and Rules.

Assessment and collection of cess:

- In the absence of well-functioning assessment mechanism, the comprehensive profile of construction works was not available. The Board was unaware as to the position of cess actually assessable/ realizable and had no control over the process of realisation of cess. As a consequence, instances of retention/ utilization of cess by test-checked auditees without remitting it to the Board leading to short receipt of cess of ₹ 20.59 crore came to notice. Possibility of more such cases of short-collection was also substantial as assessment mechanism was not working. All these construed to indicate that such lapses were affecting the collection of cess, adversely.

Implementation of provisions of the Act and Rules:

- Registration of establishments was abysmally low at only 419 during 2015-20. In the test-checked RLOs, there was no mechanism for registration of establishments. Registrations were done only when establishments applied for registration to these RLOs. Lack of interest among Government functionaries and Local Bodies was also an attributable reason for poor registration. It was a matter of concern that 68 *per cent* of the establishments inspected by Audit were functioning without registration.
- Veracity of the data on registered beneficiaries was also not vouchsafed in the absence of database with the Board. A sharp decline in registration under the Act during 2015-20 was contrary to the directive issued by the Hon'ble Supreme Court.
- Inspection of building and other construction sites were not given due priority. No targets were prescribed and only limited number of inspections were conducted. Audit, however, in course of joint physical verification, found issues affecting health and safety of workers.
- Beneficiary survey conducted by Audit disclosed that 95 *per cent* of the workers interviewed were not registered under the Act owing to lack of awareness. Consequently, they had no scope to avail benefits of the Act.
- None of the registered employers, under the test-checked RLOs, submitted the statutory intimation regarding the date of commencement and completion of any construction work. Penal provisions of the Act were, however, not invoked.
- Board is yet to implement crucial recommendations of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Labour even after four years.
- All these shortcomings showed that there was substantial scope for improvement in the implementation scenario of the Act right from registration of establishments/ beneficiaries to the adoption of recommendations of the Standing Committee of the Lok Sabha.

Implementation of welfare schemes:

- State Government introduced (April 2017) the SSY 2017 scheme and included the construction workers under its ambit. The benefits under SSY were to be paid out of Cess fund only. However, with the advent of the scheme, the expenditure incurred in implementing schemes under the Act fell drastically by 84 *per cent* from ₹ 155.85 crore in 2017-18 to ₹ 25.16 crore in 2019-20. Discontinuation of some major components which had accounting for a larger part of benefit disbursed during 2015-17, was a matter of concern.
- Benefit schemes relating to other welfare measures, which were prescribed under the Act, for which ₹ 15.38 crore was disbursed in 2015-16, were discontinued from 2016-17 onwards. Components like loans and advances for house construction and payment of premium on account of Group Insurance scheme, though prescribed under the Act, were never implemented.
- All these, not only deprived the construction workers from the intended benefits of these schemes but also resulted in violation of connected provisions of the Act. Moreover, such non-implementation also contributed to accumulation of unspent scheme funds.

Financial Management:

- There was huge accumulation of fund in BOCWWF (including bank interest accrued thereon) registering an increase of 166 *per cent* during 2015-20 owing to non-implementation of various components of schemes envisaged under the Act and directives issued by the GoI as well as non-widening of beneficiary base.

Human Resource Management:

- The Board and its lower level functionaries were handicapped by shortage at various levels of inspecting cadre. Consequently, inspection and registration activities were impeded adversely affecting implementation of schemes under the Act.

Monitoring and Internal Control Mechanism:

- There existed no Internal Audit wing to watch over realisation of time barred cheques/ DDs, etc. Social Audit was not conducted though there was specific directive of the Hon'ble Supreme Court. Accounts of RLOs were not prepared; neither was the Report on functioning of the Board. All these indicated inadequate monitoring and internal control mechanism which calls for attention of the Government.

*(Paragraph 2.2)***Functioning of Krishak Bazars in West Bengal**

West Bengal is predominantly an agrarian state with varied agro-climatic conditions facilitating cultivation of a wide range of crops.

To facilitate better marketing of agriculture produce of the marginal farmers for more remunerative price and to ensure availability of quality produce at comparatively lower price to the consumer, Government of West Bengal (GoWB) decided (March 2012) to set up *Krishak Bazar* (KB) in each of the 341 blocks of the State with loan assistance from National Bank for Agriculture & Rural Development (NABARD) under Warehouse Infrastructure Fund (WIF)

scheme. The West Bengal State Agricultural Marketing Board (WBSAMB), a statutory body under Agricultural Marketing Department (AMD), was the nodal agency to implement these projects.

A Detailed Compliance Audit (DCA) was undertaken on functioning of KBs in West Bengal. The audit aimed to assess whether planning, execution and operationalization of *Krishak Bazars* were in consonance with the objective and modalities envisaged under the project reports and complied with West Bengal Agricultural Produce Marketing (Regulation) Act 1972 and Rules made thereunder. Apart from this, compliance to guidelines of the schemes under which the projects were funded (*e.g.*, RKVY, National Agriculture Market, RIDF, *etc.*) and orders brought out by the Agricultural Marketing (AM) Department was also examined.

Audit scrutinised records of Agriculture Department, Agricultural Marketing Department, West Bengal State Agriculture Marketing Board (WBSAMB or Board), which maintains records in respect of all the *Krishak Bazars* (KBs) in the State during February 2021 to August 2021. For detailed scrutiny and for ascertaining actual status of functioning of KBs, Zilla Regulated Market Committees (ZRMC) of six districts (Murshidabad, Birbhum, Purba Bardhaman, Nadia, Cooch Behar and Howrah) were also scrutinised in detail covering a period from 2015-16 to 2020-21.

Feasibility study and project preparation:

- Non-assigning of due importance to the feasibility study resulted in lack of interest among the targeted traders in shifting their business to the newly constructed *Krishak Bazars*. This led to non-utilisation of created assets on many occasions leading to non-achievement of objectives of setting up KBs.

Market functionality and use of infrastructure:

- Owing to deficient functioning of KBs and lack of interest among targeted local farmers, substantial number of newly created infrastructure remained unutilised since construction. Such unutilised infrastructure included large number of open sheds, auction halls, administrative buildings, *Krishak Sahayata Kendra* and most of the Weigh Bridges.
- Lack of demand of stalls were evident as only 43 *per cent* of constructed stalls were functioning. No bank, post office and ATM were set up in any test-checked KB, except Kalna-II & Rampurhat-I KBs though envisaged by the Government.
- In deviation from the core objective, all godowns constructed for storing agriculture produce of the marginal farmers, were leased out to the Food & Supplies (F&S) Department for storage of paddy/ rice against a token annual rent.
- Installation of weigh-bridge were ill-planned as almost all the weigh-bridges in test-checked KBs were never put to use due to design-demand mismatch.
- The operational KBs also fell short in terms of amenities like sufficient number of toilets, running water supply, availability of drinking water, *etc.* The aspect of management of waste was also neglected as there were instances of open littering of wastes in and around markets, overflowing of vats making the area reeking with foul smell.

Non fulfilment of some other schematic targets:

- There were instances of non-achievement of various scheme milestones. There were delays ranging from 51 days to 416 days in construction/ handing over of 67 per cent of KBs. Moreover, in violation of the project stipulation, no licences were issued to businessmen running businesses in the KBs of six districts (excepting two KBs in one district) as of July 2021 even after lapse of almost four to seven years. Such gross under-utilisation of infrastructure/ facilities also adversely affected the commercial viability of the KBs as only a miniscule proportion of projected revenue was actually generated in test-checked KBs.

National Agriculture Market:

- National Agriculture Market (e-NAM) was launched in April 2016 by the Government of India as a pan-India electronic trading portal. It aimed at integrating the existing Agricultural Produce Market Committee markets (APMC mandis) for creating a unified national market with pan India e-trading facility for agricultural commodities.
- In West Bengal, e-NAM started functioning in March 2018, and as of July 2021, out of 537 markets in the State, only 18 markets, of which nine were KBs, were found integrated with the e-NAM. Out of 53 KBs test-checked by Audit, five were covered under e-NAM.
- Functioning of these five test-checked KBs, in respect of various components under e-NAM, fell way short of the objectives envisaged, while substantial quantum of funds remained unutilised. Most of the equipment procured with e-NAM funds remained idle due to non-posting of technical staff. This led to non-fulfilment of the objective of opening up the unified pan India market to the farmers through proper quality assurance of agriculture produce.

Various issues of financial indiscipline:

- There were issues of financial management in implementation of the scheme. WBSAMB unauthorisedly retained the accrued interest of ₹ 103.56 crore on scheme funds without refunding the same to the Government, violating the directions of both central and state governments. Audit also came across various instances of financial indiscipline in the form of undocumented fixation of high rates for installation of Weigh Bridges, incurring an excess expenditure by allowing unduly additional rate applicable for riverine areas in a KB well connected by road, diversion of Bringing Green Revolution to Eastern India (BGREI) funds, etc.

*(Paragraph 2.3)****Adequacy (sufficiency, assessment of quality) of Working Women's Hostels***

The Detailed Compliance Audit (DCA) on Adequacy (sufficiency, assessment of quality) of Working Women's Hostels (WWHs) aimed to examine the level of compliance to requirement of the schemes/ guidelines governing setting-up and maintenance of WWHs. While doing so, the activities of the Departments in ensuring adequacy and sufficiency of WWHs and their facilities and quality of accommodation were assessed with reference to guidelines of the scheme issued by the Ministry of Women and Child Development, Government of India (GoI) as well as by the Housing Department, Government of West Bengal (GoWB) as the case may be.

WWHs sanctioned under the GoI scheme, are affiliated to the Women & Child Development & Social welfare (WCD&SW) Department, which is the responsible Department of GoWB for handling the GoI scheme. WWHs under this scheme were to be run by Implementing Agencies (IAs) like (Urban Local Bodies, Non-Government Organisations, State Agencies, Self Help Groups, etc.). Apart from the GoI Scheme, GoWB constructed WWHs under Housing Department for accommodating working women against monthly rent. These WWHs are run/ managed directly by the Housing Department.

This DCA was conducted during November 2020 to February 2021 covering period from 2015-16 to 2019-20 (with fact positions updated upto February 2021). Apart from scrutiny of records of WCD&SW and Housing Departments, Directorates thereunder and District level functionaries and divisions, joint inspection of 40 WWHs located across nine districts was conducted.

Demand for accommodation not assessed:

- State Government did neither do any need based assessment for requirement of accommodation facilities for working women, nor take advantage of the GoI scheme which was to bear 60 *per cent* of the project cost. No new project under GoI scheme has been approved and sanctioned for the State since 2002-03.
- In the absence of basic records, *e.g.*, total applications received, hostel allotted and pending applications, Government was not in a position to assess sufficiency of WWHs.

Non-availability of information on the existing WWHs under WCD&SW Department:

- It was a matter of concern that the WCD&SW Department did not maintain any dependable database of existing WWHs and was even unaware of the latest functioning status of many of those hostels.

Functional status of WWHs:

- Whereabouts of as many as seven WWHs, out of 40 test-checked WWHs, were not traceable, which calls for serious attention of the Government.

Quality of accommodation in WWHs:

- There were substantial shortfall in basic amenities and facilities of the functional WWHs. Complete absence of day care facilities have made the WWHs unsuitable for working mothers. Absence of basic facilities like clean drinking water in almost half of the test-checked WWHs, absence of power back up, washing machines, refrigerators, *etc.*, posed hardships for working women in maintaining a decent standard of living in those hostels.
- Infrastructure-wise the hostels were not made livable for working women with disabilities.
- The aspect of safety and security were inadequate in many hostels.

Status of occupancy in WWHs:

- Sixteen functional hostels under WCD&SW Department had a total capacity of 1052 boarders. Against which only 472 boarders (45 *per cent*) were residing. In respect of the five functional WWHs under Housing Department, against the sanctioned capacity of 457, only 380 (83 *per cent*) were allotted till the date of audit thereby leaving 77 accommodations vacant.

- Existence of ineligible boarders in the test-checked hostels represented possibility of genuine beneficiaries remaining deprived of the benefit of the scheme.

System of management and monitoring:

- Violating the scheme guidelines, neither the WCD&SW Department nor the District Administration monitor the functioning of the hostels under the scheme. Even the WWHs in Kolkata were not monitored by the Social Welfare Directorate. No half-yearly report on the implementation of the scheme was sent to the GoI during the entire period covered in audit.
- Hostel Management Committee was not formed in any of the WWH in the State. Housing Department also have not devised any mechanism to ensure management and monitoring of operations of the hostels under its control.
- Such lax monitoring facilitated a number of implementing agencies discontinuing hostel service/ using building for other purpose and even seven WWHs becoming untraceable. No penal action was taken by the WCD&SW Department against the concerned IAs, though there were enabling clause in the guidelines/ agreements.

(Paragraph 2.4)

Construction and Functioning of Hostels under School Education, Backward Classes Welfare and Tribal Development Departments

The Detailed Compliance Audit (DCA) on Construction and Functioning of Hostels under School Education Department, Backward Classes Welfare Department and Tribal Development Department, aimed to examine whether requirements of hostels had been assessed before taking up construction, construction work was completed in due adherence to plan and financial discipline, utilisation of the created hostels was optimal and in consonance with Departmental/ Government policies, rules, orders issued from time to time. School Education (SE), Backward Classes Welfare (BCW) and Tribal Development (TD) Departments constructed, run and maintained different types of student hostels.

The DCA was conducted during November 2020 to September 2021 covering the period from 2015-16 to 2019-20 and hostels in five districts (Bankura, Paschim Medinipur, Purulia, South 24 Parganas and Malda) selected through statistical sampling. The three Departments were covered in audit. This apart, in selected five districts, audit visited 78 hostels under three departments as well as 29 School Attached Hostels and 14 additional non-functional hostels under BCW and TD Departments.

Assessment of demand among targeted population not undertaken:

- There were deficiencies in the process of assessment of demand for students' hostels among the target groups by all three departments. The same was compounded by issues like non-deployment of staff to operationalize newly created hostels, admission of students nearer to their residences, poor condition of many old hostel buildings and even instances of non-payment of hostel charge by the students who are paid maintenance cost through Direct Benefit Transfer. Instances of hostels being constructed in places where there was lesser or no demand for such hostels were also noticed. On the other hand, places where the hostels could have been utilized remained

uncovered. Even the functional hostels were found to be running with low occupancy.

Construction activities of hostels:

- Out of total 123 hostels taken up for construction under various schemes, 89 were completed, while construction of 34 hostels either remained incomplete or work did not commence. Factors attributable to such delay included land dispute/ litigation, lack of funds, premature termination of contract, delayed issue of work order and resistance from the school authorities. This resulted in non-percolation of hostel facilities to students of those areas. However, many of the newly completed hostels remained unused.

Utilisation of constructed hostels:

- Lack of planning and coordinated action among the various stakeholders for implementation of projects resulted in many hostels remaining incomplete or completed with reduced capacity. Inability of the district authorities to provide safe or secured accommodation or engage staff for running of many completed hostels led to those hostels remaining non-functional or functional with low occupancy rate. Lack of initiative and coordination among two Departments on operation of two completed Residential Schools led to the same being not taken over from the construction agency.
- Seventy hostels (involving total actual cost/ sanctioned cost of ₹ 166.16 crore) under three Departments remained non-starter for years together. Such situation was attributable to factors mostly of administrative in nature (*e.g.*, non-deployment of staff, absence of electricity connections, absence of amenities, security issues, *etc.*) indicating lack of active monitoring of the district level functionaries, while instances of planning deficiencies (*e.g.*, construction of post matric hostels with no colleges nearby) were also noticed.
- Moreover, in case of five more hostels (one involving sanctioned cost of ₹ 3 crore, while cost is not available for other two pairs), no staff were posted even after sanction of posts. Non-functioning of those hostels defeated the basic objective of providing a safe and secure educational environment to the children of the targeted group.

Non-finalisation of policy of running the BR Ambedkar Residential Schools:

- Lack of co-ordination among Departments and deficient initiative led to non-finalisation of the modalities of running the two completed schools under BR Ambedkar Residential Schools project which ultimately deprived the targeted students from its intended benefits.

Quality, safety & security of accommodation in the hostels:

- Functioning of the students' hostels was adversely affected by acute shortage of crucial staff, which compromised the desired supervision on activities of students. Deficient amenities like safe drinking water, mosquito nets, adequate number of toilets, *etc.*, calls for immediate attention of the Departments as unhygienic accommodation would affect the core objective of unhindered education of the hostellers. Moreover, Audit observed absence of requirements of healthy physical and mental upbringing of a child such as safe and secure environment, outdoor and indoor recreational facilities.

Financial management:

- Poor fund management under different schemes pertaining to student hostels led to instances of funds remaining parked with various authorities and surrender of central fund. This resulted in fund not being utilised optimally for the purpose for which it was sanctioned.

(Paragraph 2.5)

Draft Paragraphs

For establishment of Automatic Weather Stations (AWSs) to generate real time weather related information for farming purposes, from installation to its Annual Maintenance Contract, a private entity was allowed the technical autonomy. Poor maintenance of these AWSs, by the private entity, rendered these AWSs ineffective and as a consequence the intended objective could not be achieved.

(Paragraph 3.1)

An expenditure of ₹ 5.95 crore incurred by the West Bengal Scheduled Castes Scheduled Tribes & Other Backward Classes Development and Finance Corporation for setting up of Career Paramarsh Kendra at each Sub-Divisional Headquarters station remained mostly unfruitful as the objectives of extending career guidance and assistance to unemployed SC/ ST youths were not achieved.

(Paragraph 3.2)

Avoidable expenditure of ₹ 1.52 crore towards lease rent of the vacant space by Directorate of Consumer Affairs and Fair Business Practices, under the Consumer Affairs Department.

(Paragraph 3.3)

Cancellation of a valid tender on flimsy ground by the Food & Supplies Department for procurement of sugar for Public Distribution System supply setting aside recommendation of the Tender Selection Committee, led to an excess financial burden of ₹ 20.84 crore on the state exchequer.

(Paragraph 3.5)

12257.99 Metric Tonnes of Custom Milled Rice (CMR), procured during Kharif Marketing Season, 2016-17, at a cost of ₹ 30.50 crore, deteriorated owing to prolonged and improper storage.

(Paragraph 3.6)

Deficient monitoring on the part of West Bengal Essential Commodities Supply Corporation Limited (CMR agency) and inspecting officials of Food & Supplies Department resulted in non-receipt of CMR against payment of Minimum Support Price of ₹ 2.19 crore.

(Paragraph 3.7)

Due to failure in exercising proper check, Health & Family Welfare Department made extra payment of ₹ 10.20 crore towards premium of Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojana (RSBY).

(Paragraph 3.9)

The State Nodal Agency, Swasthya Sathi Samiti, Health & Family Welfare Department did not recover ₹ 6.11 crore from Insurance Companies for their under-performance, in spite of having enabling provisions in the agreement.

(Paragraph 3.10)

Due to adoption of higher rate of compaction factor, the West Bengal State Rural Development Agency incurred an extra expenditure of ₹ 1.48 crore in construction of rural roads, under the Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana.

(Paragraph 3.14)

Failure of Assessing Authorities (AAs) to detect irregularities in claims of Input Tax Credit resulted in evasion of tax of ₹ 42.13 crore.

(Paragraph 3.15)

Despite detection of cases of irregular claims of Input Tax Credit by two dealers, proceedings to levy penalty were not initiated. Consequently, penalty of ₹ 1.33 crore was not levied.

(Paragraph 3.16)

In four cases, the AAs assessed tax of ₹ 2.36 crore instead of ₹ 3.86 crore due to mistakes in computation. This resulted in short levy of tax of ₹ 1.50 crore.

(Paragraph 3.17)

In thirteen cases, the Contractual Transfer Price (CTP) was determined at ₹ 48.73 crore, instead of ₹ 142.91 crore. This resulted in short determination of CTP by ₹ 94.18 crore with consequent short levy of tax by ₹ 5.87 crore.

(Paragraph 3.18)

In four cases, AAs allowed deductions of ₹ 59.14 crore instead of admissible deductions of ₹ 49.06 crore, from the Contractual Transfer Price (CTP). This resulted in short determination of taxable CTP by ₹ 10.08 crore, with consequential short levy of tax of ₹ 1.00 crore.

(Paragraph 3.19)

AAs did not initiate proceedings to impose penalty, even after detection/ assessment of evasion of tax of ₹ 22.35 crore. This resulted in non-imposition of penalty at a minimum of ₹ 5.60 crore, with the maximum being ₹ 44.70 crore.

(Paragraph 3.20)

AAs incorrectly determined turnover of sales at ₹2,783.59 crore instead of ₹ 3,166.98 crore in 17 cases. This resulted in short determination of turnover of sales by ₹ 383.38 crore with consequent short levy of tax of ₹ 30.49 crore.

(Paragraph 3.22)

Non-compliance of provisions of West Bengal Excise (Country Spirit) Rules, 2010, by a private licensee of a Country Spirit Bottling Plant, resulted in non-realisation of Hologram Wastage Regulatory Fee of ₹ 54.96 crore.

(Paragraph 3.23)